

Hiding a verb

Ritual vs. courtly interpretation of *Aṣṭhādhyāyī* 1.4.34

What's in the *Aṣṭhādhyāyī*

- Sūtra 1.4.34 belongs to the *kāraṅga* section of the grammar
- Pāṇini defines semantic roles
- There are 6 such roles: *apādāna* 'source', *sampradāna* 'receiver', *karāṅga* 'instrument', *adhikarāṅga* 'location', *karman* 'patient', *karṭṛ* 'agent'
- Each *kāraṅga* is defined semantically
 - Definition: situation + prototype
 - Prototype corresponds to the *kāraṅga* role
- For each definition there is a number of additions or exceptions
 - The class is enlarged with additional semantic characterizations
 - This is limited to specific verbs (roots)

What's in the *Aṣṭhādhyāyī*

- Sūtra 1.4.34 inherits from sūtra 1.4.32

karmaṇā yam abhipraiti sa sampradānam

“*sampradāna* ‘receiver’ is defined as the person whom one wishes to connect with the object (of the verb)”

- Example of a supplemental definition: sūtra 1.4.33

rucyarthānām priyamāṇaḥ

“*sampradāna* ‘receiver’ is also the pleased one, with verbs synonymous of *ruc* ‘to please’”

- The reason is clear:
 - both are marked by the dative

Sūtra 1.4.34

- Now, to the sūtra 1.4.34

ślāghahnuṁsthāśapām jñīpsyamānaḥ

Sūtra 1.4.34

- Now, to the sūtra 1.4.34

ślāgha-hnuñ-sthā-śap-ām jñīpsyamānaḥ

“With the verbs *ślāgh* ‘to praise’, *hnu* ‘to hide (?)’, *sthā* ‘to stand’, and *śap* ‘to curse’, *sampradāna* is the person whom someone intends to inform”

- Two issues here
 - Verbs
 - *jñīpsyamāna*

Post-Pāṇinian debate

- *Mahābhāṣya* is silent on this sūtra
- The discussion starts with the *Kāśikāvṛtti* (7th cent. AD)
 - however, only is *jñīpsyamāna* debated, not the verbs
- What's the difficulty of *jñīpsyamāna*?
 - simple root: *jñā* 'to know'
 - +CAUS: *jñāp* 'to make someone know'
 - +DESID: *jñīps* 'to want to make someone know'
 - +PASS: *jñīpsyā* 'to be wanted to be made to know'
- Commentators are especially concerned with DESID

Post-Pāṇinian debate

- My issue concerns the verbs
 - *ślāgh* ‘to praise’, *śap* ‘to curse’
 - *sthā* ‘to stand’
 - *hnu* ‘to hide (?)’
- The first two are verbs of speaking
 - They can have the addressee
- The verb *sthā* can be interpreted as a verb of speaking
 - cf. English *to make a statement*
- What does ‘hiding’ have to do with verbs of speaking?

Post-Pāṇinian debate

- Commentators try to accommodate the “desiderativeness”
 - You praise someone *and* you want him/her to know about this
 - You make a statement towards someone *and* you want to make him/her to know about this
- The same model should be valid for *hnu*
 - ...but this is self-contradictory
 - you cannot hide something from someone *and* make him/her aware of the hiding

The meaning of *hnu*

- Grammarians' examples
- *Kāśikāvṛtti*

*jñīpsyamānaḥ jñāpayitum iṣyamaṇaḥ, bodhyitum abhipretaḥ.
devadattāya ślāghate. devadattaṃ ślāghamānastām ślāghāṃ
tam eva jñāpayitum icchati ityārthaḥ. evam devadattāya hnute.*

“The term *jñīpsyamāna* means someone ‘wanted to be made know’, or ‘intended to be made aware’. E.g., *devadattāya ślāghate* means ‘s/he, while praising Devadatta, wants to make him aware of that praise’. The same explanation applies for *hnu*: ‘while hiding from Devadatta she wants Devadatta to know about this’”.

The meaning of *hnu*

- Illustrations: a love scene
- *Bhaṭṭikāvya* (8.74)

*rocamānaḥ kudṛṣṭibhyo, rakṣobhyaḥ prattavān śriyam |
ślāghamānaḥ parastrībhyas, tatr'āgād rākṣas'ādhipaḥ ||
aśapta nihnuvāno'sau Sītāyai smaramohitaḥ | dhārayann
iva c'āitasyai vasūni pratyapadyata.*

“There came the king of the demons, delighting those with evil eyes, giving glory to the demons, flattering the wives of others. Deluded by love, dissembling, he vowed to Sita, and as if in debt he gave her gifts”.

(Transl. by O. Fallon)

The meaning of *hnu*

- Illustrations: love scene evolving further
- *Bālamānoramā* (17th cent. AD) on *Siddhāntakaumudī*
*kṛṣṇāya hnute iti. sapatnyapanayanena svāśayaṃ kṛṣṇaṃ
bodhayati.*
“The meaning of *kṛṣṇāya hnute* is the following. By removing herself from the fellow-wives, she reveals her desire to Kṛṣṇa”.
- Note: *hnu* is used intransitively
- Also note: to hide only in order to be found by the beloved is a typical seduction behaviour

The meaning of *hnu*

- Illustrations: a scene from the “middle-class” life
- *Padamañjari* (12th cent. AD) on *Kāśikāvṛtti*
devadattāya hnute iti sannihitam eva devadattaṃ dhanikāder apalapatīty arthaḥ.
“The meaning of *Devadattāya hnute* is the following: he denies Devadatta (in his presence) from the creditors”.
- Note: the object of hiding and the addressee of *hnu* are the same person
 - *hnu* is glossed with *apalap* ‘to deny’
 - “grammarians’ Sanskrit” (see Whitney 1884)
 - Haradatta: *anye tu āhuḥ* ‘but others say’

The meaning of *hnu*

- Illustrations: love scene + the “transitive” usage
- *Tattvabodhinī* (17th cent. AD) on *Siddhāntakaumudī*

[*kṛṣṇāya*] *hnuti iti. sapatnībhyaḥ kṛṣṇam hnuvānā
tamevārtham kṛṣṇam bodhayati.*

“The meaning of *kṛṣṇāya hnuti* is the following. While hiding Kṛṣṇa from the fellow-wives, she reveals this fact to Kṛṣṇa”.

The real meaning of *hnu*

- The real meaning of *hnu* cannot be ‘to hide’
 - *hnuñ apanayane* ‘the meaning of *hnu* is in the removal’
- Etymology: uncertain
 - Perhaps connected to *hū* ‘to call’ (see Hollifield 1978)
- Vedic data:
 - Always middle
 - Never transitive!
 - Never without a preverb
 - Clearly a verb of speaking

(Late) Vedic attestations of *hnu*

- Śatapathabrāhmaṇa 1.1.3.10
prokṣitā stheti | tad etābhyo nihnute
“sprinkled be you! With these words he makes amends to them”
- Śatapathabrāhmaṇa 1.5.1.16
prajāpataye nihnute [...] etad devatābhyo nihnute
“[the Hotṛ] propitiates Prajapati [...] he propitiates the deities”
(from Eggeling’s translation)
- Often preceded by *tad* or *atha*, like a typical verb of speaking

Lexicography of *hnu*

- *Amarakośa* (1.192.2)
 - A derivative of *hnu* is listed in the *Śabdādivarga* ‘speech-related section’
supralāpaḥ suvacanam apalāpas tu nihnavah
“eloquence is good speech, while concealment is atonement”
- But *Dhāṭupāṭha* (2.76):
 - *hnuṅ apanayane* “the root *hnu* means removal”

The real meaning of *jñīpsyamāna*

- Let's “degrammaticalize” this word
 - There is no need to analyze it morphologically
 - It must have a simple, non derived, meaning
- A related term *jñīpsā* ‘inquiry, question’ is attested
 - *Dhātupāṭha* 6.149: *prach jñīpsāyām* “the root *prach* means questioning”
 - Therefore, the passive form *jñīpsyamāna* means
 - ‘the asked one’
 - ‘the one to whom questions are made’
 - ‘the addressee’

The cause of the misunderstanding

- Later commentators did not realize the exact semantic area of some of Pāṇini's rules
 - Pāṇini's universe of the discourse referred to the Vedic ritual
 - Medieval commentators had in mind a different world: passions and private life instead of divinities and rituals

References

Eggeling, J. (transl.). 1882. *The Satapatha-Brâhmana According to the Text of the Mâdhyandina School. Part I: Books I and II*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press.

Fallon, O. (transl.). 2009. *Bhaṭṭi's Poem: the Death of Rāvaṇa*. New York: New York University Press & the JJC Foundation.

Hollifield, P. 1978. "Indo-European etymologies". *Journal of Indo-European Studies* 6: 173–183.

Whitney, W. D. 1884. "The Study of Hindu grammar and the study of Sanskrit". *The American Journal of Philology* 5(3): 279–297.

Thank you